The First Japanese Language Education in the Ottoman Empire (1891-92): Shotaro NODA’s Lectures in the Ottoman Military School

Nobuo MISAWA, Goknur Akcadag

The Bulletin of Faculty of Sociology, Toyo University

Vol. 46 No. 1

Page range: 219-248

Year: 2008-12

URL: http://id.nii.ac.jp/1060/00003064/

Creative Commons: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/deed.ja

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>著者名/英名</th>
<th>藤田重太郎 倉田耕郎</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>言語</td>
<td>英語</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>誌名</td>
<td>造韻学会紀要</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>号</td>
<td>第12号</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>年</td>
<td>1990年</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ページ</td>
<td>1-25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/deed.ja
The First Japanese Language Education in the Ottoman Empire (1891–92): Shôtarô NODA’s Lectures in the Ottoman Military School

オスマン朝における日本語教育の創始（1891～92年）：陸軍士官学校における野田正太郎の講義

Nobuo MISAWA
三 沢 伸 生
Göknur AKÇADAĞ
ギョクヌル・アクチャダー

I. Introduction

It is said that “the Tragedy of the Ottoman Battleship "Erteğrul" in the year 1890 is the starting point of the relationship between Japan and the Ottoman Empire.\(^1\)

This tragedy let some Japanese people to visit Istanbul. In January 1891, the two Japanese battleships HIEI [比叡] and KONGÔ [金剛] arrived at Istanbul to send back 69 survivors of the tragedy to the Ottoman Empire. Then the Ottoman Empire requested them to provide someone who can stay in Istanbul for the Japanese language education in the Ottoman Military School. Finally Shôtarô NODA [野田正太郎], who is the reporter of *Jiji Shinpô* [時事新報], accepted the Ottoman request to be the lecturer of the Japanese language for about two years.\(^2\) *Jiji Shinpô* is the one of the Japanese newspapers published in Tokyo. Soon after the tragedy, this newspaper did well in the both leading the public opinion and collecting the donation money for the Ottoman Empire. Then *Jiji Shinpô* company sent his own reporter NODA on board in HIEI to Istanbul with the exchange certificate of the donation money accounted 4,248,976 Yen to handle for the Ottoman Foreign Minister.\(^3\)
Unfortunately the first Japanese language education in the Ottoman Empire came to the end for only two years. And its detailed information was forgotten. NODA was the only Japanese lecturer who gave the lessons of the Japanese language in the Ottoman Military School. Today, there are many misunderstandings about this first Japanese language education in the Ottoman Empire. Among such misunderstandings, it is said that the lecturer was Torajirō Yamada [山田寅次郎]. Furthermore it is said that Yamada lectured the Japanese language for young Mustafa Kemal (later Atatürk).\(^{(4)}\) It is incredible why such quite wrong error stories came up. The Ottoman Empire never appointed Yamada as the lecturer of the Japanese language, and never asked Yamada to teach the Japanese language. And also the Japanese language education program was ended in December 1892 before young Mustafa Kemal entered the Ottoman Military School.

Unfortunately even today such terrible error stories expand through various popular mass-media communication, like TV-programs or popular magazines, in both Japan and Turkey without any investigations. In addition, such misunderstandings are not limited to the case of the first Japanese language education in the Ottoman Empire, but various stories about the relationship between Japan and the Ottoman Empire. It is necessary to correct the errors and fix the essential fact with a lot of source materials in both Japan and Turkey to recognize the true relationship between Japan and the Ottoman Empire.

For the second our case study of such academic investigations, we try the verification of an essential fact of the first Japanese language education in the Military School of the Ottoman Empire, with the both Japanese and the Ottoman Turkish source materials.\(^{(5)}\)

II. Source Materials

Apparently the poor source materials are responsible to the misunderstandings about this first Japanese language education in the Ottoman Empire. The reason why the previous researchers treated Yamada as the lecturer of the Japanese language education is that they did not try to find source materials to certify the basic facts.

From the beginning of the new century, many source materials are coming up. MISAWA pointed out that the newspapers and magazines published in both Japan and the Ottoman Empire contain so many evidences about the relationship
between Japan and the Ottoman Empire. Then MISAWA and AKÇADAĞ found the Ottoman official documents about the relationship between Japan and the Ottoman Empire, preserved in archives in Istanbul, with the full-scaled investigation. Recently the academic study about Rohan KÔDA [幸田露伴], one of the greatest Japanese novelists, got so many source materials out of the Japanese written works. They provide us so many new facts about YAMADA that MISAWA could make his early activity in Istanbul clear. There is a young Turkish scholar to verify the Japanese descriptions of YAMADA. According to such a circumstance, we can describe the real situation to make certain of the misunderstandings with the new source materials in this article.

Actually YAMADA is the most famous person in the history of the relationship between Japan and the Ottoman Empire (and later the Republic of Turkey). On the contrary with his fame, he handed down to us few records about his activity in the Ottoman Empire and the Republic of Turkey. Due to this poorness of the source materials, the previous scholars obliged to get information from his short autobiographies and biography written by his friend under his supervision. As we mentioned before, today we found a lot of new source materials (“the forgotten source materials” in the other words) about the real situation of NODA and YAMADA in the Ottoman Empire. These source materials could clearly modify the misunderstandings. We found that there are so many exaggerated information, wrong information and unreliable information in YAMADA’s autobiographies and biography. In the academic historical researches, the researchers must investigate the autobiography and biography with the sufficient criticism by the other source materials. Now we cannot admit them as the previous source material. We must investigate the official and private documents, and various descriptions included in books, magazines and newspapers in both Japan and Turkey.

III. The Establishment (February 1891)

Recently, Shôtarô NODA’s existence in the history of the relationship between Japan and the Ottoman Empire begins to be recognized again. His achievements that contributed to set up the first relationship between Japan and the Ottoman Empire have forgotten for quite a long time. In response to the royal request of the Ottoman Sultan Abdûrhamid II, he decided to give up returning to Japan and
set up his residence in Istanbul. He was the first Japanese who had his residence in the Ottoman Empire.

The two Japanese battleships HIEI and KONGÔ stayed in Istanbul from January 2 to February 10, 1891. During this short stay of the Japanese crews, how the Ottoman Empire got the idea of the Japanese language education? And why NODA got the position of the Japanese language lecturer?

In the evening of February 8, NODA got the opportunity to have an audience with the Ottoman Sultan Abdürrhamid II for the first time at the farewell reception party for the Japanese battleships that was held on by the Ottoman Sultanate. He wrote down this situation in Jiji Shinpô as follows.

“...The Ottoman Sultan Abdurrahimid II approached to me. His Majesty clenched my hand, and said to me as follows. “I am very pleasure that you had mastered our Tukish language. This fact proves that you are akilli (=clever.).” Actually I was able to understand only these sentences. His majesty gave more speech to me for five minutes. But the Royal Secretary did not translate his majesty’s speech to English for me because he judged that I could understand Turksih very well. I am so sorry that I could not understand his majesty’s speech any more. I wonder that there were the words of thanks for our donations, and the splendid expressions in his majesty’s speech. I had no oppotunity to convey as follows. “I cannot already understand Turkish enough, please translate his majesty’s speech for me.” At last the Ottoman Sultan Abdurrahimid II gave me the golden cigarette case that was decorated with about 100 diamonds as the present for the memory of the audience with his majesty. ...omission... It was the unprecedented event that the Ottoman Sultan clenched the hand of the young jounalist such as me. The newspaperes of Istanbul reported this incredible news.”

「……皇帝は近くに進み寄られて余の手を握り脅ひ「僅かの間に我土耳其語を挙げられたるは深く满足に思ふ所にして此一事足下のアクルル（賢き）と読す可し」とあり是丈けは了解せしが夫より五分間許り引續きて御話ありたりとも式部長官は余に限り充分土耳其語を解し得るものと思ひてか英語に通辯して呉れず其跡は鼓膜に震動したのみに止まりしのみを遺憾あれも彼の義故の禮儀もありあしおらん或是記念に存す可き妙句もありしならんかあれども前後の場合「余は左様好は土耳其語に通ぜず通辯を願ふ」と申す機を得ざりしをより読見
NODA was very interested in the Ottoman Turkish language before he arrived at Istanbul. Even in Japan, he made a request to Ali Efendi, who was of the Ottoman survivor officers, to write down his name in the Arabic script. Then he made it printed as his name cards in NAGASAKI. __________________________

Further more during the boarding in HIEI, he tried to master the Ottoman Turkish language. He got on well with the Ottoman survivor officers and learned the Ottoman Turkish. It required him to get ready for his reports in Istanbul as the articles of Jiji Shinpō. __________________________

Probably his name cards in the Arabic scripts and the little knowledge of the Ottoman Turkish language made him very famous in Istanbul. We can find his name in the various articles of the Ottoman newspapers in those days. He could work his job very smoothly as he intended.

In such ways, among the Japanese guests, NODA was reached in the Ottoman acquisition as the only person who was trying to master the Ottoman Turkish. Although his acknowledgement was so fragmentary, his attitude for the Ottoman language reached even the ear of the Ottoman Sultan Abdürhamid II.

After the aforementioned farewell reception party for the Japanese Battleships, he was requested to be the Japanese language lecturer. He himself reported this situation in the article of Jiji Shinpō as follows.

“...The messenger of the Ottoman Sultan Abdürhamid II came to HIEI for three times during the evening of February 10. They said that His Majesty the Ottoman Sultan Abdürhamid II requested NODA Efendi, the reporter of Jiji Shinpō, to stay in Istanbul to get acknowledgement with the affairs of our nation. If he stays in Istanbul, he can make many reports of our affairs for Japan. For this job, it required to master the Ottoman Turkish language. During his residence in Istanbul and in the case of his return to Japan, His Majesty the Ottoman Sultan Abdürhamid II will take into all accounts as his own son....”

「……十日の夕刻より夜に掛て土耳其皇帝の急使三たび比叡に到る、其使命の略に曰く土耳
NODA accepted this royal request. In the very short time The Ottoman Empire provided his residence space in the Military School as his description as follows.

“...In the next morning of February 11, the day when the two battleships will leave from Istanbul, I moved to the Ottoman Military School with my own traveling cases, and was provided the special room preserved for the Ottoman Sultan. The Ottoman Sultan Abdürhamid II sent 6,000 piastres to prepare the room ....”

「…明けて十一日即ち両艦出発の當日急々行李を携へて土耳其陸軍大学校の奧の間、土耳其皇帝の為に設けある一室に引移りたり皇帝は余の為めに六千ビアスタを同校に下し調度裝飾残る所なく…」⑹

Moreover NODA was presented the Ottoman imtiyaz decoration of the third rank on February 13 (see Figure 4 & Appendix 2).

We must notice that NODA himself accepted the royal request as his study of the Ottoman Turkish language, not his teaching of the Japanese language to the Ottoman officers. After the two Japanese battleships left from Istanbul, he was requested to be the lecturer of the Japanese language. We can also find this situation at his article of Jiï Shinpò.

“The Ottoman Turkish Language. After I decided to live in Istanbul due to the royal request, Zeki Paşa visited me to ask my condition every day.⑴ He was the Vice Admiral of the Ottoman Army and also the head of the Ottoman Military School. He informed that I must go to the Yldız Palace every Friday to get opportunity to meet the Ottoman Sultan Abdürhamid II. The two Ottoman officers were at work in my room. They were Recep Efendi (the Lieutenant of the Ottoman Army) and Sabri Efendi (the Second Lieutenant of the Ottoman Navy). So I made the plan to master the
Ottoman Turkish language every day from them. In the turn, I am teaching them the Japanese language. When I went outdoors of the military school, either of them accompanied me and reported my activity to the royal palace. I was astonished such a treatment. After one month, Zeki Paşa informed me that he provide more two officers to learn the Japanese language...."

「土耳其語 土耳其皇帝は余を官地に留めてより陸軍大校校中将ゼッキパシャ（ゼキ・パシャ Zeki Paşa）は皇帝の命を受け日々来れて余の安否を訪は又金曜日にはユルウズ宮へ出て、皇帝に謁見せ可しとの事なり陸軍大尉レジェブイフェンディ（レジェブ・エフェンディ Recep Efendi）、海軍少尉サブリイフェンディ（サブリ・エフェンディ Sabri Efendi）の両氏常に余の室の火を余は六箇月にて土耳其言を習ひ果せんとの心穏は日々両氏に聴び又望に依て両氏に日本語を教授し居りり外出の折は両氏の内一人必ず余を護りて片時も離れず出人の度毎に之を記して宮中に報ずるなりと少し窮屈に思ふ程の次第なり一箇月の後尚二人の日本語生徒を興ふる旨ゼッキパシャは此程余に告げたり......」[18]

In such way, NODA gradually accepted teaching the Japanese language to some officers in the Military School as his duty. He himself admitted it as what he must give for studying the Ottoman Turkish language.

When we read his article, it seems that the Ottoman Empire gradually found the opportunity to let NODA been the lecturer of the Japanese language. NODA thought that he was appointed to be the first Japanese who mastered the Ottoman Turkish language. But NODA did not know the Ottoman intention. We can find the more detailed situation why he was requested to stay in Istanbul among the discussions between the Japanese naval crews and the Ottoman Empire.

From the first stage of the discussions, the Ottoman Empire requested to provide a Japanese crew for the lecturer of the Japanese language as taking residence in Istanbul. Actually the Ottoman Empire requested the Japanese Naval officer of HIEI or KONGÔ, not the Japanese private citizen like NODA. We find the evidence in the official report of the commander Tsunatsune TANAKA [田中綱常], the captain of KONGÔ.[19] At the welcome reception party held at the the Yildiz Palace on January 5, the Ottoman Empire requested the both captains of the two Japanese battleships to provide the suitable Japanese Naval officer to remain in Istanbul for studying the Ottoman Turkish language and the more
detailed information about the Ottoman Empire. Later at the meeting between the two captains and Mine Paşa, the Ottoman Royal Palace Secretary, on January 13-14, he offered the same request. Further more he suggested the second request. If it is impossible to provide any officer of the two battleships, it is enough to send the Japanese Naval officer after the two battleships returned to Japan. The two captains were very confused to this request. At last they rejected. Actually it was impossible for the both captains to provide any their officers. With huge amount of the Japanese budget, the two battleships were sent to the Ottoman Empire not only to send back 69 survivors, but also to give the experience to the young officers. In those days, the Japanese Navy was required to arrange the well-experienced officers. They had the responsibility to let any young officers grown up in this voyage. Actually later in the Russo-Japanese War (1904-06), the officers who went to Istanbul got the great credits to the victory, like Masayuki AKIYAMA (the future Vice Admiral of the Japanese Navy).

Unfortunately the two captains had no authority to response to the Ottoman request for setting up the relationship between Japan and the Ottoman Empire. But at last they got out of the way to provide the Japanese citizen NODA. According to the memoir of the Lieutenant Hajime SAKAMOTO [坂本一] (the future Vice Admiral), at the farewell reception party for the Japanese Battleships on February 8, the Ottoman Sultan Abdürhamid II requested to provie the Japanese officer to remain in Istanbul again. The captains suggested that Şehit arə NODA, instead of the naval officers, was so suitable person for the royal request.\(^{20}\) This fact can be supported the article of Jiji Shinpô, entitled “the way why the reporter of Jiji Shinpô remained in the Ottoman Empire”. At first NODA rejected the royal request, not as written in his article. The Ottoman officer requested the assistance of the captain TANAKA to recommend him to accept the royal request. Also the Ottoman Empire sent aforementioned Zeki Paşa to HIEI to offer more detailed suggestion. At last NODA accepted the royal request.\(^{21}\) The Ottoman Sultan Abdürhamid II was so pleased to hear the news of his acceptance, and ordered to present him 30 pounds as the bonus money. And Jiji Shinpô company also admitted the desicion of their reporter. In this way, sometimes NODA sent his reports about the Ottoman Empire to Jiji Shinpô, that were published as the continuous articles.\(^{22}\)
IV. The Execution (February 1891 - December 1892)

Soon after the two Japanese battleships were welcomed in Istanbul, the Ottoman Empire planned the first Japanese language education in the Ottoman Military School by the Japanese lecturer, with the very strong intention due to the royal order of the Ottoman Sultan Abdürhamid II. As we verified with the sources, NODA was appointed as the lecturer.

At first NODA was not requested to teach the Japanese language to the Ottoman officers, but in the very short time he accepted the job for his study of the Ottoman Turkish language. However he was so eager to teach the Japanese language to the Ottoman officers. Actually he was the very good lecturer. According to his article dated August 22, 1891, published in Jiji Shinpô, he was so astonished the excellent smartness of Vastf Efendi, one of his 7 students fixed on the Ottoman Army. According to NODA’s description, at first there were two students. In March, there were 4 students. In August, there were 7 students. Unfortunately we cannot find how many students had learned the Japanese language at NODA’s lesson. We have only one photograph of NODA and his students (see Figure 1).

Of course in those days, it was impossible to get the Japanese language education materials in Istanbul. So NODA ordered Shūtarō IMAIZUMI [今泉秀太郎], his old colleague of Jiji Shinpô, to send the textbooks (of composition for the elementary school in Japan) and the Japanese writing goods (the Indian ink, the ink stones, the bamboo brushes, etc.) to Istanbul. In a very short time, IMAIZUMI sent them as the gift. NODA made his four students to send the Japanese letters for IMAIZUMI to express the sense of pleasure. They were Recep Efendi (the Lieutenant of the Ottoman Army), Ali Efendi (the Second Lieutenant of the Ottoman Army), Asum Efendi (the Second Lieutenant of the Ottoman Army) and Sabri Efendi (the second Lieutenant of the Ottoman Navy). Two of them were published as the Japanese letters written by the Ottoman officers in Jiji Shinpô, dated January 31, 1892. And IMAIZUMI also published all of four letters in his memoir. Especially the letter written by Recep Efendi was published as the original copy by the stone edition (see Figure 3). The transcription and the translation of the letter is as follows.
December 7, 1891

Dear Mr. IMAIZUMI,

We are brothers from the origin. There is no other Creator other than our Creator. We are also brothers by nature. Because we are made from the same elements. It is surprising that our feelings are so resemble each others. This might be our Creator's blessing. This fact might be evidence that both countries are consisted with the same race. Both two countries are in good relationship as if one of them belonged to the other. There might be such an origin among us. This is the reason why our lecturer is studying the Ottoman Turkish language, and we are studying the Japanese language. Well, it is necessary to study hard with the good teacher for the master of the foreign language. Further more we need to learn the reading and the composition perfectly. Gradually our new wise teacher leads us from the elementary level to senior level. Thanks to his lessons, we have advanced to the conversation very well. But as for the reading and the composition, only a single sentence is so difficult to understand. I cannot show you our gratitude feelings except saying ‘Thank you’. I learned your name. It is impossible to meet you in this world other than the next life after death. You helped us in this difficult situation. To advance our study in step by step style, you gave a lot of books. They have the huge value for us though their sales price might be not high. Thank you very much. Hereafter, I hope to continue our friendship so long.

The student of the Japanese language in the Ottoman Military School

The Lieutenant of the Ottoman Army, Recep
We are so astonished that the Ottoman officers could write such letters in the Japanese language with the Japanese writing goods. Of course, there were some little mistakes. And we can find the Islamic logical feelings among them. So we can believe that these letters were written by the Ottoman officers. And they certified the responsible relationship between NODA and his students. Actually the almost of sentences in these letters were written with HIRAGANA characters, the original Japanese characters. As the introduction of these letters in the reports of Jiij Shinpô, NODA declared that he would make his students mastered the ability of the Japanese composition to write such letters with HIRAGANA characters and KANJI characters, the Chinese characters. Moreover, NODA sent such students’ letters to the Japanese legations in Europe to introduce the Japanese language education in the Ottoman Empire. As the response, NODA got the letter from Tsurutarô CHIGA [千賀鶴太郎], who were teaching the Japanese language in the Oriental Languages School of Berlin. Later NODA sent the article about the situation of the Japanese language education in the European countries with CHIGA’s letter to Jiij Shinpô. (30)

As time went by, NODA himself acquainted with his job as two faces. He was the student of the Ottoman Turkish language, and also the lecturer of the
Japanese language for the Ottoman officers. At February 5, 1892, after about one year stay in Istanbul, he wrote a letter for the Ottoman Sultan Abdürrhamid II to inform his level of the Ottoman Turkish language, with his occupation as “The Turkish Language Student & the Japanese Language Lecturer” (see Figure 6 & Appendix 3).

During his residence in Istanbul, NODA did not regret cooperating to the Japanese visitors. According to his article dated January 13, 1892 published in Jiji Shinpô, he guided Keigo KIYOURA [清浦奎吾], the member of the Japanese National Assembly and the former head of the Security Blanch, and Shôtarô KAJI [加地鈴太郎], owing to the request of the Ottoman Empire. On the day April 4, 1892, the other Japanese visitor arrived at Istanbul with the captain Hidaka’s letter. It was Torajirô YAMADA.

His sudden visit to the mansion of Saíd Paşa, the Ottoman Foreign Minister, made the great trouble. The people at the mansion were at loss with the Japanese who cannot fluently speak the French language, the common foreign language of the Ottoman Empire. At last NODA was called for the remedy of this curious guest. NODA welcomed and helped this young Japanese as possible as he could. Without NODA’s assistance, YAMADA had to be at loss. In some way, YAMADA could stay in Istanbul for his main aim to make short research about the possibility of the trade business between Japan and the Ottoman Empire.

It is completely mistake that the Ottoman Empire ordered YAMADA to teach the Japanese language at the Ottoman Military School. The Ottoman Empire did not employ YAMADA as the lecturer. We cannot find any official documents of the Ottoman Empire about his employment. On the contrary, we can easily find some official documents of the Ottoman Empire that verify the employment of NODA as the aforementioned lecturer of the Japanese language at the Ottoman Military School (see Figure 5 & Appendix 2). There is a picture that show YAMADA’s figure with NODA and his students. Besides with his autobiographies and biography, there is no other evidence that can provide his connection with NODA’s class other than this picture. But this picture never certifies that he was employed as the lecturer of the Japanese language. There is the striking fact that denies his career. YAMADA visited Istanbul at April 4, and left from Istanbul to came back home to Japan in July or August 1892. At first YAMADA
stayed in Istanbul for only 4-5 months. In the autumn of 1893, after more than one year's interval, he came to Istanbul again. YAMADA never said this fact, but we can verify it with various articles of the newspapers and magazines in Japan. During his absence in Istanbul, the Japanese language education came to end suddenly as follows.

V. The Expiration (December 1892)

Before the end of the year 1892, NODA gave up his job with the permission of the Ottoman Empire and left Istanbul for Wien (=Vienna). The Ottoman Empire rewarded him with the Ottoman intiyaz decoration of the second rank for his contribution to the Japanese language education. His retirement means the end of the Japanese language education in the Ottoman Military School. There is no other Japanese who were living in Japan. It is impossible to continue the Japanese language lessons. About two years ago, the Ottoman Empire, of course including the Ottoman Sultan Abdürhamid II, was so eager to establish the Japanese language education with the Japanese lecturer. Why the Ottoman Empire gave him the permission of the retirement? NODA did his very best for his lectures of the Japanese language for the Ottoman officers. Why he gave up his job? The students also took a great interest in studying the Japanese language. We wander why the first Japanese education in the Ottoman Empire ceased suddenly. Unfortunately we have no source materials to certify the reason of this sudden end.

Only NAITO pointed out that he gave up his job because of his illness. But we can find the fact that he returned to Japan after the round trip of Europe and America in his reports published in Jiji Shinpō. Of course, it is possible that NODA made up his illness as the reason for giving up his job. But it is difficult to believe that he had illness to come back home to Japan. Although NODA himself kept the silence about the real reason of his coming back home, he expressed his happy residence in Istanbul for two years in his report of Wien in Jiji Shinpō, dated December 26, 1892. NODA recollected that he was satisfied with his residence in Istanbul.

It was the really round trip of the earth. NODA came to Istanbul by the way of the Suez Canal, and went back home via European countries and the United Sates of America. He could select his route for Japan. In January 1893, he
entered Paris and sent the reports entitled as “The Orient Museum in Gime” and “The Castle of Paris in the wind and rain”, that were published in *Jiji Shinpō*.\( ^{33} \) Crossing the Atlantic Ocean, he entered Chicago and also sent the report of the Exhibition for *Jiji Shinpō*.\( ^{34} \) Then he came back to Japan at one day of April or May 1893. Then, he started to work in Tokyo as the reporter of *Jiji Shinpō*.

MISAWA, one of the authors, made a mistake that *Noda* made *Yamada* the successor of the lecturer of the Japanese language education.\( ^{35} \) As the previous researchers did, MISAWA also believed *Yamada*’s description about his residence in Istanbul. As above mentioned, at the time of *Noda*’s retirement in December 1892, *Yamada* was not in the Ottoman Empire but in Japan to engaged in the inducement activities for his plan of the trade business between Japan and the Ottoman Empire. It was impossible that both *Noda* and the Ottoman Empire appointed *Yamada* as the lecturer of the Japanese language education. Because *Yamada* was admitted as the only guest of short stay in Istanbul by *Noda* and the Ottoman Empire. Both *Noda* and the Ottoman Empire had no idea to make *Yamada* the lecturer of the Japanese language. This is verified by the fact that there is no official document of the Ottoman Empire in BOA about *Yamada*’s appointment as the lecturer of the Japanese language on the contrary with his descriptions in his biography and autobiography. If he was appointed as the lecturer, there must be any official documents as the case of *Noda*. *Yamada* exaggerated some of his private assistances for *Noda*’s lectures as the official lecturer requested by the Ottoman Empire. Furthermore, it is possible that *Noda* never contacted with *Yamada* after this very short-time guest came back to Japan from Istanbul in July or August 1892. Before *Yamada* returned to Istanbul from Kōbe to begin the trade business between Japan and the Ottoman Empire in the autumn of 1893,\( ^{36} \) the Japanese language education in the Ottoman Empire was closed as the aforementioned way. If the Ottoman Empire established the second Japanese language education in the Ottoman Military School with the appointment of *Yamada* as the lecturer during his residence in Istanbul for a long time until the beginning of the World War I, there might be a lot of source materials to verify. The fact that there is no evidence to verify his lectures of the Japanese language suggests his descriptions were the exaggerated story. If his description is true, why his students kept silence about their study of the Japanese language? We must insist again that the first (and
perhaps ‘only’) Japanese language education in the Ottoman Empire ended in December 1892.

In addition, we would like to refer about the famous misunderstanding related to Mustafa Kemal. Actually YAMADA told in his biography that Mustafa Kemal said to YAMADA in direct that he saw YAMADA in the Ottoman Military School when he studied as a young officer. But we suppose this story completely false due to two facts as follows. First, the date that YAMADA got the opportunity to have an audience with the President Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, was wrongly recorded in his biography. The biography recorded this story at the party for the memorial day of the Republic at October 29, 1931. But the party that YAMADA was present as the General Manager of the Association for the Trade Business between Japan and Turkey was took place in Ankara at October 29, 1930. YAMADA did not go to Turkey in 1931. It is possible to say only simple careless mistake. Second, YAMADA did not mention his great chance to get the opportunity to have an audience with Mustafa Kemal Atatürk at all in the Reports of the Japanese Commercial Museum in Istanbul, the monthly official bulletin of the Association for the Trade Business between Japan and Turkey. This official inspection trip of YAMADA as the General Manager of this association was reported with the detailed information in the above mentioned bulletins. Also YAMADA himself wrote the total report of his trip to Turkey and Greece. But there was no mention to the honorable meeting with Mustafa Kemal Atatürk. There is no reason to keep it secret. On the contrary YAMADA and the association might announce it public in the large scale for the promotion of the trade business with Turkey. So we can conclude that YAMADA never got the opportunity to have an audience with Mustafa Kemal Atatürk at the party for the memorial day of the Republic at October 29, 1930. Mustafa Kemal Atatürk never said his own story as described in YAMADA’s biography. This story is the completely false. This is an example of various exaggerated stories included in his autobiographies and biography. Besides with the officials in the Japanese Embassy in Turkey, we knew that there were only a few Japanese persons who got the opportunity to have an audience with Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, such as the Prince and Princess of TAKAMASTU-no-MIYA and the famous Turklogy scholar Kōji ŌKUBO, but YAMADA. It is the reason why we cannot encounter any Turkish written works about Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, refered to his study of the Japanese language in the
Ottoman Military School. It was the misunderstanding that we must correct.

VI. Conclusion

The Ottoman Empire tried to establish the Japanese language education in the Military School for about two years, from February 1891 to December 1892. According to the new found source materials in both Japan and Turkey, we could verify the basic fact of this education. It is not clear that the Ottoman Empire find any benefit in this education. According to the circumstance of the world affairs in those days, Japan had no important power to attract attentions from the other countries. It is possible that the Ottoman Empire found any importance in the Japanese language education in the Military School. After the Sino-Japanese War (1894-5) and the Russo-Japanese War (1904-5), Japan was begun to be admitted as one of the powerful countries. But the Ottoman Empire had no plan to re-establish the Japanese language education in any academic institutions.

It requires the further investigation about any source materials related to the Ottoman officers who learned the Japanese language at NODA's lessons in the Ottoman Military School. Some officers sent the Japanese letter to NODA after he returned to Japan (see Figure 2). Actually some of them had the sense of debt for him, and kept their knowledge of the Japanese language for a while. There must be any effects of the first Japanese language education in the Ottoman Empire to the Ottoman society and culture. In future, we would like to try to make them clear.

【Appendix 1 : Transliteration of Figure 4  İ.DH.95140, BOA】

Yıldız Saray-ı Hümâyûnu
Baş Kitâbet Dâiresi

Ma’rûz-ı çâker-i kemineli dirki

/1 Şubat 1306/4 Recep 1308/
Ser- Katip Hazret-i Şehriyârı
Sürreya

【Appendix 2 : Transliteration of Figure 5  DH.MKT. 107/62, BOA】

Huzûr-ı Âli Hazret-i Sadâret-Penâhi’ye

Nazmi 28 Temmuz 1309

Mekteb-i Harbiye-i Şâhâne’de Türkçe tahsîle me’mûr Japonyalı Abdüllahim Efendi (= NODA’s Muslim name) ’ye atîye-i Seniye olarak ıhsân buyurulması Hazinece ifâ üç yüz sekiz senesi dâhiliyle tahsisâtı süretilinden mahsusûn icrâ olunan on beş bin kurulu hakkında nezâret-i âciziyê bergûna irâde-i seniye-i cenâb-ı padişâhi tebâli buyurulmuş olduğundan meblag-ı mezkûrun atiye tertibinîn meşđüddetiyle binâen sene-i merkime muvazisin âçığına ve tertib-ı mezkûr fasîlasına vilayetten tesiyesi husûsunun istizânî mûhâsebe-i nezâretten ifâde kılınış olmakla icrâ-yı icâbi menût müsâade-i âliye cenâb-ı sadâret-penâhîden ol bab da

Battâtî Muhasebeye verildi.

【Appendix 3 : Transliteration of Figure 6  Y.PRK.AZJ. 21/1, BOA】

Cenâb-ı Hak Sevgili Merhametli Padişâhımız Efendimiz Hazretlerini şu mübarek Leyle-i Regâib hürmetine her türlü arzû-î hacîlîna muvaîfik ve dünyalar durduktça serîr-i maâlîmasîr hilâfet-penâhîlînderinden müebbede buyûrsun âmin!

Kulları

Mekteb-i Harbiye-i Şâhânelerinde Türkçe Tahsil
Ve Japonca Tedrisine Me’mûr
Japonyâli
Abdülhalim

※Thanks to the Ottoman Archive of the Prime Ministry in Istanbul (Başbakanlık Osmanlı Arşivi), The Maritime Museum in Istanbul (Deniz Müzesi), and Tokyo Turkish Embassy (Tokyo T.C.Büyükelçiliği) for the supports of my academic researches.

※This study is one of the results of the academic research project, “The Basic Study about the Relationship between Japan and Turkey (Representative : Associate Prof. Nobuo MISAWA, Faculty of Sociology, TOYO University)”, sponsored by JSPS (No.20520623, 2008-2010)

Notes

(1) For the general information about “the Tragedy of Erçuğrat”, see CHUÔ BÔSAI KAIGI SAIGAI KYÔKUN NO KEISHÔ NI KANSURU SENMON CHÔSA IINKAI 2005. It contains the detailed stories depended on both the Japanese and the Ottoman Turksih source materials. We also can get the detailed information about her difficult voyage to Japan from KOMATSU’s research. See KOMATSU 1989.

(2) We are sorry that there was wrong transcription as Jîchi Shinpô in the previous articles of MISAWA. It was quite a careless mistake. Accurately it must be transcribed as Jiî Shinpô.
(3) For the details of the Japanese donation money about "the Tragedy of Ertuğrul", see MISAWA 2002, 2003a, 2003b. In addition, there is the misunderstanding about the amount of the donation money that YAMADA brought to the Ottoman Empire. Some previous scholars pointed it as over 5,000 Yen. It is not true. According to the receipt of YAMADA preserved in the Maritime Museum in Istanbul, he brought 1.823 kurus (=about 96.91 Yen), only 2% of total Japanese donation money.

(4) This story came from the description of YAMADA’s biography as follows. "Mustafa Kemal said to me, ‘I had the acquaintance with you. When you taught the Japanese language in the Ottoman Military School in Istanbul, as one of the young officer of the Ottoman Army, I had seen you.’" (=「パシャは余は貴方を面識せりといひ、氏がそのかみ君府の士官学校にて日本語を教えし頃、パシャも少壯将校の一人にて氏を見知れり…」(see SANSHÔTEI SHUJIN 1952, pp.70-71). Today this story became very famous in Japan owing to the reference of the previous studies (see, NAGABA 1996, p.52 (=「私は貴方と面識があります。イスタンブルの士官学校で日本語を教えられていた頃、私は少壮将校の一人として教えてもらいました」), MATSUTANI 1998, pp.87-88 (=「私を覚えていますか。あなたに日本語を教わった士官です」). Their translations of Mustafa Kemal’s phrase to the modern Japanese language are not correct. There was no phrase that indicated Mustafa Kemal had learned the Japanese language). But at the starting point we cannot take this story as the true story with two evidences. This is completely false, as we will verify with the detailed investigation later in this article.

(5) The authors of this article (MISAWA and AKÇADAĞ) did the verification of an essential fact of the first Japanese Muslim, with the source materials written in both the Japanese language and the Ottoman Turkish language (see MISAWA & AKÇADAĞ 2007). NODA is the first Japanese Muslim that can be verified with the various source materials. So, in the other words, it is possible to say that our article is the second verification of his contributions to the relationship between Japan and the Ottoman Empire.

(6) For example, see MISAWA 2002, 2003a, 2003b, 2003c. All of MISAWA’s articles show any reference of such new found (or ‘forgotten’ in the other words) source materials.

(7) Due to our full-scale investigation of the Ottoman official documents in Istanbul, we found new source materials to prove NODA was the first Japanese Muslim, Abdüllahim. See notes (3).

(8) See DEGUCHI 2006. According to this splendid study, we found that YAMADA was one of KÖDA’s friends. Further more there is the short novel that was described the young YAMADA as the ‘Student Merchant’ among KÖDA’s novels. MISAWA tried to get YAMADA’s descriptions fixed up. See the bibliography of MISAWA 2007.

(9) See MISAWA 2007. MISAWA pointed out that the commercial relationship between Japan and the Ottoman Empire was established with the strong intention of YAMADA. Although YAMADA himself told that he was obliged to begin the trade business by the Ottoman request, his words were completely false. We can easily get many evidences of this fact among the Japanese written works of KÖDA and YAMADA himself. See KÖDA 1802-3.


(11) YAMADA wrote three short autobiographies: YAMADA 1901, 1911b, 1939. The first series of his autobiography published in the magazine (YAMADA 1901) were ended before he entered in Istanbul as the magazine obliged to give up its publication. These autobiographies are very short and gave no detailed information. One of his friends, SANSHÔTEI SHUJIN [山槇亭主人], wrote the biography of YAMADA under his supervision for the private publication: SANSHÔTEI SHUJIN 1952.

(12) Ji ji Shinbō, no.3029, May 24, 1891.

(13) Ji ji Shinbō, no.2816, October 23, 1890.

(14) Ji ji Shinbō, no.2854, January 30, 1891.

(15) Ji ji Shinbō, no.3029, May 24, 1891. But NODA made a mistake about the date. As mentioned
before, HIEI and KONGÖ left from Istanbul on February 10. So the royal request came to HIEI in the evening of February 9, and NODA moved to the Ottoman Military School in the morning of February 10.

(16) Ibid.

(17) Mehmet Zeki Paşa was the 17th head of the Ottoman Military School (= Harbiye Harpokulu) during the years 1884-1908. He was very famous that he invited the German Göltz Paşa to the Ottoman Army. See [HARP OKULU] n.d., pp.26-32.

(18) Jiji Shinpō, no.3030, May 25, 1891.

(19) The official report of the Captain TANAKA, preserved in Kōbunbikō of the Department of the Navy in Japan.

(20) SAKAMOTO 1925, pp.10-11. HATANO pointed out that the Ottoman Empire desired SAKAMOTO to remain in Istanbul (see HATANO 1999, p.58). Although HATANO provided no evidence about it, it is natural because the Ottoman officers admitted the talent of SAKAMOTO as the interpreter of the two Japanese captains.

(21) Jiji Shinpō, no.3016, May 11, 1891.

(22) See MISAWA 2004. During his residence in Istanbul for about two years, he sent about 50 articles to Jiji Shinpō that published to give impulse to the Japanese people.

(23) Jiji Shinpō, no.3151, October 4, 1891.

(24) Shūtarō IMAIZUMI, also famous as Ichibō IMAIZUMI as the first Japanese painter of humor pictures, was the cousin of Yukichi FUKUZAWA [福澤諭吉], the real founder of Jiji Shinpō. After NODA got board on HIEI in October 1890, IMAIZUMI chased him from Yokohama to Kōbe by the express train, and succeeded in handing the exchange certificate of the donation money accounted 4,248,976 Yen while HIEI stopped at Kōbe. Actually he was also one of the contributors to set up the relationship between Japan and the Ottoman Empire. The four letters of the Ottoman officers are contained in his memoir. See IMAIZUMI 1901, 68-72.

(25) Jiji Shinpō, no.3253, January 31, 1892.

(26) Jiji Shinpō, no.3317-3318, April 15-16, 1892.

(27) Jiji Shinpō, no.3287, February 11, 1892. The BOA preserved the Ottoman official document about the request to NODA for their guide in Istanbul. See the BOA document Y.PRK.ASK. 78/40 (dated H.1309 Cemaziyi‘ahur 27 = December 29, 1891). Their official visit was also reported in the Ottoman newspaper. See Resmiî Gazette, 43, 1307, p.525. ŞAHİN pointed out their visit, although she could not identify their personal names. See ŞAHİN 2002, pp.102-3. KIYOURA wrote the details of his short stay in Istanbul with NODA in his memoir. See Anonim 1935.

(28) Although young YAMADA studied the French language in Yokohama, he come to Istanbul with a letter for Saïd Paşa written in English by himself. We supposed that the article of NODA is true that pointed out YAMADA’s poorness at the French language. See MISAWA & AKÇADAĞ 2007, pp.96-97.

(29) See the BOA document İ.HUS.1310Ca·02 (dated November 24, 1892) and İ.ML.1310Ca·02 (dated November 30, 1892). These official documents suggest that he prepared his retirement step by step.

(30) See the BOA document İ.TAL.1310Ca·64 (dated November 26, 1892).

(31) NAITO 1931, p.178. NAITO described as follows, “NODA had the residence in the room of one of the small palace, and taught the Japanese language for the five officers in the Ottoman Military School with the rank of the Lieutenant for a year. At last he had to give up the job and died soon after he came back to Japan. We cannot believe this description according to the new found source materials.”

(32) Jiji Shinpō, no.3571, February 5, 1893. It is possible to calculate the day of his departure from Istanbul was the day of December 23. Because he wrote he left Istanbul before three days ago. Probably he left Istanbul for Wien by train.
(33) *Jiji Shinbun*, no.3587, February 24, 1893, do, no.3595-6, March 5 and 7, 1893.
(34) *Jiji Shinbun*, no.3617, March 31, 1893. This is the last report written by NODA from abroad.
(35) See MISAWA 2003c, p.46.
(36) *Yomiuri Shinbun*, no.6128, August 24, 1894. YAMADA moved to the west area of Japan from Tokyo for the investment activities. At last he left from Kōbe, the biggest harbor in Japan, to go to Istanbul again.
(37) See note 3.
(38) MISAWA made the reproduction of all of 90 issues of this bulletin. The Japanese Commercial Museum in Istanbul was the very important to identify the relationship between Japan and the Republic of Turkey. See MISAWA 2006, MISAWA(ed.) 2008.
(39) We can find the detailed information about this official trip of YAMADA to Turkey in the *Reports of the Japanese Commercial Museum in Constantinople (=Istanbul*) no.5-10, 1930-31. See ibid.
(40) See YAMADA 1931.
(41) Today some scholars noticed that it is necessary to study about the effects of the Russo-Japanese War on the Ottoman Empire. See ESENBEL 2008, INABA 2003, 2006, 2008, SHILLONY 2008. But there are no investigation depended on the newspapers and magazines published in both Japan and the Ottoman Empire. It requires the more source materials to know the real situation in those days.

**Bibliography**

**Documents (in the Ottoman Turkish language)**

The Ottoman Archives of the Prime Ministry in Istanbul = Başbakanlık Osmanlı Arşivi (here after BOA)

Dahiliye Nezareti Dahiliye Mektubu Kalemı (DH.MKT.) 107/62
İradeler Dahiliye (LDH.) 951/40
İradeler Hususi (L.Hus.) 1310Ca-02
İradeler Maliye (L.ML.) 1310Ca-02
İradeler Talıfat (L.TAL.) 1310Ca-64
Yıldız Perakende Askeri Maruzat (Y.PRK.ASK.) 78/40
Yıldız Perakende Arzuhal ve Jurnaller (Y.PRK.AZJ.) 21/1

The Maritime Museum in Istanbul = Deniz Müzesi

The Receipt of Torajirō YAMADA (at the corner of the Ottoman Battleship of Erтуğrul)

**Documents (in the Japanese language)**

The Archives of the Department of the Navy

*Kō bun biki*, vol.5-the second half part: the vessels, issued in the year 1891. [『明治廿四年公文備考』(巻5、昭和・下)]

**Descriptions (in the Japanese language)**

IMAIZUMI, Ichibyō (=Shūtarō) 1901. *Ichibyō Zatsuwa*, Tokyo: Seishi-dō. [「今泉一瓢（ = 秀太郎）『一瓢雑誌』(福井順作：記) 東京：誠之堂，1901年]  
KŌDA, Rohan 1892-3. "Shosei Shōnin (= Student Merchant), (1)- (3)", *Kōin Shinshī*, 68, 44-48: 69, 24-

239
27: 70, 32, 35-37. [幸田露伴『書生商人』『戊辰新誌』68, 44-48 頁, 69, 24-27 頁, 70, 32, 35-37 頁]


SANSHÔTEI SHUJIN 1952. ‘Shingetsu (=the Thin Crescent Moon)’ Torajirō YAMADA, Ōsaka: Teruhiko IWASAKI (the private edition). [山槇亭主人『新月山田寅次郎』大阪: 岩崎輝彦 (私家版)]


—— 1911a. Toruko Gakan (=The Pictoral Look at Turkey), Tokyo: Hakubun-kan. [山田寅次郎『土耳其景觀』東京: 博文館]


—— 1939. “Souvenir de mes cinquante ans en Turquie”, Le Monde islamique, 3:3 • 4, 154-159. [山田寅次郎『回顧 50 年のトルコ』『回教圈』3:3 • 4, 154-159 頁]

Studies

CHUÔ BÔSAI KAIJI SAIGAI KYÔKUN NO KEISHÔ NI KANSURU SENMÔN CHÔSA IINKAI (=The Specialized Committee about the Succession of the Disaster Lesson, under the Central Disaster Prevention Council) 2005. The Report about the the Tragedy of the Ottoman Battleship Ertuğrul (1890), Tokyo: Chuô Bôsaî Kaiji. [中央防災会議災害教訓の継承に関する専門調査委員会 『1890 ユルトゥールル号事件報告書』東京: 中央防災会議災害教訓の継承に関する専門調査委員会]

DEGUCHI, Tomoyuki 2006. “Rohan KÔDA and Torajirô YAMADA: the matters which connect ‘the Student Merchant’ and ‘the Records of Drunk and Fun’”, Japanese Modern Literature, 74, 77-91.[出口智之『幸田露伴と山田寅次郎:「書生商人」と「酔興記」をつなぐもの』『日本近代文学』74, 77-91 頁]


2004. “Reports about the Ottoman Empire carried on Fijī Shinpō (1890-93): achievements of Shōtarō NODA, the first Japanese journalist who was sent to the Islamic World”, *The Bulletin of Faculty of Sociology, Toyo University*, 41-2, pp.109-146. [三沢伸生「1890～93年における『時事新報』に掲載されたオスマン朝関連記事: 日本人初のイスラム世界への派遣・駐在新聞記者たる野田正太郎の業績」《東洋大学社会学部紀要》41-2, 109-146頁]


Figure 1. Shôtarô NODA (the second person from left of the front line) with his students
The person sitting left with a bird in hand is Torajō YAMADA, as the guest. The single photograph
at the right side is Mehmet Zeki Paşa, the head of the Ottoman Military School (cf. the right figure).
※This photograph was pictured during YAMADA’s short stay in Istanbul (April-August, 1892)

Figure 2  Sabri Efendi’s letter cover that addressed to Shôtarô NODA in Japan
【Date: 20/Kanun-i sani/ H.1308 = February 1, 1893】(preserved in the Turkish Museum, Wakayama,
JAPAN)
Figure 3  Recep Efendi’s letter that addressed to Shūtarō IMAIZUMI in Japan  
[Date: December 7, 1892] (published as the original copy by the stone edition in IMAIZUMI 1901)
Figure 4 The Ottoman official document about the decoration for Shōtarō NODA
【Date: 1/Recep/H.1306 = February 13, 1891】(İ.DH 95140, preserved in BOA, Istanbul, TURKEY)

Figure 5 The Ottoman official document about the royal presents for Shōtarō NODA
【Date: 28/Temmuz/R.1309 = August 9, 1893】(DH.MKT. 107/62, preserved in BOA, Istanbul, TURKEY)
Figure 6  Shōtarō NODA’s letter for the Ottoman Sultan to inform his level of the Ottoman Turkish language

【Date: 24/Kanuni-sanı/R.1307= February 5, 1892】(Y.PRK.AZJ 21/18, preserved in BOA, Istanbul, TURKEY)
【日本語抄訳】

オスマン朝における日本語教育の創始（1891〜92年）
：陸軍士官学校における野田正太郎の講義

三沢伸生

ギョクヌル・アクチャダー

日本とオスマノ朝との関係史は、1890年の「エルトゥールル号事件」に始まると言われる。
この事件を契機にして、オスマノ朝の首都イスタンブルの陸軍士官学校において日本語教育が創始されることになった。しかしながらこの日本語教育に関しては卷間に様々な誤解が流布しており、その実態がきちんと解明されてこなかった。
日本とトルコにおいて、保存される（あるいは埋没していた）文書史料や公刊史料を様々な発掘・分析したうえで、1891年2月から1892年12月までの約2年間にわたって、オスマノ朝からイスタンブルに長期在留を請われた野田正太郎が講師となって数名の陸軍・海軍士官に対して日本語教育を行ったことが事実として解明された。
野田の日本語講師採用に至る経緯があった。1891年1月早々に事件の生存者69名を送還するためにオスマノ朝までやってきた日本海軍軍艦の指揮官がイスタンブルに入港を果たしたことにより一時的に日本への関心が高まり、オスマノ朝（一説には君主であるスルタンのアブデュルハミト2世自身）は陸軍士官学校において日本軍士官の在留を請うて日本語教育を創始することを企画した。しかし富国強兵推進の折、日本軍人側はこの要請を断り、代わりに自社募集の義捐金を届けに来た時事新報記者の野田正太郎を在留日本語講師に推薦した。
こうして野田はイスタンブルに留まることとなり、自らはオスマノ語の習得に励む一方で、数名のオスマノ朝士官たちに熱心に日本語を教えた。野田は日本の同僚に教材の送付を頼み、会話からはじめて漢字混じりの読み書きまで教えた。その成果の一端は、時事新報纸にも掲載された。
しかし1892年12月に野田が突然に日本へ帰国したことによって、このオスマノ朝における最初の日本語教育は幕を閉じることとなった。2年間の日本語教育がいかなる意味を有しているのか、日本語を習った士官たちのその後など今後に解明すべき課題は多々残されている。
また山田善次郎がオスマノ朝の要請により長期間にわたって陸軍士官学校で日本語講師を務めていたという指摘があるが、完全な間違いである。様々な新史料が示す事実により、1892年4月から7、8月までの数ヶ月の滞在中に、山田が極めて短期間かつ私的に野田の日本語教育を補助した可能性がある程度である。前述のように山田は帰国して半年も経ずに野田も帰国を決意して日本語教育は終焉を迎えたのである。1893年の夏以降に再びイスタンブルにやって来た山田が野田
を引き継いで日本語講師に就任した可能性は全く皆無であり、さらに山田の評伝に書かれているように、1930年（評伝に記される1931年は誤り）10月29日にアンカラで催された共和国記念日のパーティーに際してムスタファ・ケマル（後のアタチュルク）が士官学校時代に山田を見知っていったと山田自身に語ったということ、さらに後年の研究者たちがこれを拡大解釈してムスタファ・ケマルが士官学校時代に日本語を習ったと指摘していることは全くの事実無根である。それどころかそのパーティーで山田はムスタファ・ケマルと会話する機会すらなかったものと判断される。